Applying Indicators and Theory to the Delivery of Early Care and Education Supports for Black Families with Infants and Toddlers

Chrishana M. Lloyd, Porsche Boddicker-Young, and Catherine Schaefer
October 2021
**Issue Series Overview**

This issue series focuses on Black families, infants, and toddlers, and is funded by the Pritzker Children’s Initiative as a collaborative effort between the Equity Research Action Coalition at UNC Frank Porter Graham Child Development Institute and Child Trends. The series identifies the strengths-based programs and policies that support the well-being of Black families and their babies.

Across the series, we take the position that Black families are better supported when there is an intentional and strategic focus on designing systems and implementing programs, interventions, and strategies that build on and attend to the cultural assets and strengths of Black families. This series is borne out of this perspective.

**Introduction**

To inform their work with families, human service professionals often draw on data—such as indicators of well-being—and on theory. This issue brief highlights demographic information on Black families and uses the ZERO TO THREE *State of Babies* Indicators and Yosso’s Community Cultural Wealth Model to highlight practice-based recommendations that human service professionals can use to better support economically disadvantaged Black families with infants and toddlers in the United States.

Our focus on Black families is important. Regardless of income, Black families’ experiences in this country are punctuated by the pervasive and unrelenting impact of systemic racism, which has negative effects on nearly every facet of Black people’s existence—including their political power, access to good health care and high-quality education, connections to employment, and acquisition of income and wealth. Racism can also impact Black people’s experiences during pregnancy, which in turn can affect children even before they are born. The impact of structural racism has also resulted in a disproportionate number of Black families living in poverty, which can negatively impact infant and toddler brain and physical development, as well as family stability.

The brief provides insights to those who work directly with Black families caring for infants and toddlers, and draws on theory to guide their use of indicators in a strength-based manner. While we highlight *State of Babies* Indicators in this brief, the use and application of a strengths-based theoretical frame can be used with any indicators designed to identify challenges and areas where Black families are in need of support.

To accomplish this task, we specifically examine select State of Babies indicators focused on family, infant, and toddler well-being; present other research; and apply theory appropriate to examining the lives of economically disadvantaged Black families. We make an intentional effort to—whenever possible—avoid extensive comparisons between Black families and families of...
other racial and ethnic groups, which enables us to instead describe, understand, and share insights that are informative and speak to issues relevant to Black people in their own right. In this way, our brief contributes to a more holistic understanding of Black families that is both protective and promotive. The insights offered can also be used to inform the development and use of indicators, tools, and direct service practices for varied professionals such as human service practitioners, educators, policymakers, and others. Importantly, this brief is not intended to be prescriptive, and should be used with consideration of the particular and specific contexts of families, as well as the organizations that are providing services and supports to them.

**Black Families in the United States**

Black people in the United States comprise roughly 13 percent of the country’s total population. While the relative proportion of Black people in America has remained consistent across decades, the absolute number is increasing—up from 36.2 million in 2000 to 46.8 million in 2019. Consistent with historical trends, most of the Black population resides in the South (56%), followed by the Northeast (17%), Midwest (17%), and West (10%). And contrary to popular imagery of Black people living in urban environments, they make up about 14 percent of the Southern rural population.

About 10 percent of Black people in the United States were born outside of the country, with most from Africa, the Caribbean, and Central and South American countries. Furthermore, 24 percent of U.S. Latinos identify as Afro-Latino, Afro-Caribbean, or of African descent with roots in Latin America. In general, Black immigrant populations tend to live in larger cities in ethnic enclaves that are near neighborhoods where Black Americans reside.
Like the overall Black population, most Black families with young children live in the South or along the East Coast. Black children live in a variety of family types, including married, cohabiting, coparenting, and single-parent households. In 2019, the majority of Black children (64%) lived in single-parent families, including single parents living with an unmarried partner or with another family. Data on Black women in their childbearing years (ages 15 to 50) show that approximately 60 percent were married or living with an unmarried partner at the time of their first birth. The distinction between single and unmarried but living with a partner is noteworthy given the ways in which extended family, flexible roles and role sharing, and father involvement contribute to the psychological well-being of Black families and positive outcomes for children.

The negative impact of systemic racism has severely limited the education, income, and wealth accumulation of Black families. As a result, the average Black family’s net worth is $17,150 (as context, the average White family’s net worth is $171,000). As a result of this strain on economic stability and wealth, 34 percent of Black infants and toddlers live in poverty, which, as mentioned previously, can negatively impact their growth and development and challenge adult functioning.

At the same time, we know that various cultural assets—including optimism in the presence of obstacles, flexible familial roles, robust kinship ties, spiritual grounding, a strong work orientation, a spirit of resistance and civic protest, and the ability to maneuver through racially hostile social institutions—have helped Black people to navigate the challenges of systemic racism.
Linking Family and Child Indicators and Culturally Grounded Theory to Practice

State of Babies Yearbook and Indicators

The annual State of Babies Yearbook, released by ZERO TO THREE, provides data and policy indicators of parent and caretaker, infant, and toddler well-being by race, ethnicity, income, and geographic setting. Indicators are important because they provide concrete, measurable, and defined markers of family and child well-being, as well as a common language and standards to assess and discuss how families and children are faring. They also provide a way to benchmark areas of interest (e.g., families, children, states, cities, communities, etc.) at a single point or over time, which can inform answers to questions about the effects of early care and education programming/practice, policy, and research.

We use the State of Babies Yearbook to inform this brief because of its status as one of the most well-known, well-used, and expansive resources on the condition of parents and caretakers, infants, and toddlers across all U.S. states. Child Trends is also intimately familiar with the indicators, as we provide data analyses for the Yearbook. The Yearbook was first released in 2019, and the current 2021 edition also includes RAPID-EC data, which has a particular focus on families caring for babies, infants, and toddlers during the COVID-19 pandemic.

The relevance of the Yearbook cannot be understated. The State of Babies indicators—as with other indicators—include determinations about levels of well-being by making assessments about what is normative (i.e., good). These determinations or judgments then become embedded into the rating process that ranks states according to their achievement on certain indicators. Governments at all levels (federal, state, and local) and within early care and education (and other) agencies use indicators to inform program development and operations, direct service practices, research, and policy making about issues specific to families with infants and toddlers. For instance, indicators can be used to identify needs or gaps in services, measure the success of early care and education initiatives, or identify trends over time. Given their importance and widespread use, we suggest that utilization of indicators at a programmatic and practice level should occur with attention to culture, strengths, and context.

DATA SOURCES

State of Babies Yearbook
The State of Babies Yearbook includes national and statewide data on the well-being of families and babies in America using 42 data and 21 policy indicators that cover three domains: Good Health, Strong Families, and Positive Early Learning Experiences. Indicators can be examined by race/ethnicity, income, and geographic setting.

RAPID-EC Data
The RAPID-EC dataset augments the State of Babies Yearbook by including data collected during the COVID-19 pandemic. These data reflect how the well-being of families and babies have been affected by the pandemic, related policy changes, and associated economic crises.
To move toward a more culturally grounded, asset-focused, and holistic perspective on Black families, infants, and toddlers, we suggest viewing indicators through the lens of a strengths-based model. Here, we use Yosso’s Cultural Wealth Model as a theoretical framework to examine specific State of Babies indicators and ways to engage with Black families that build on their assets. Theory is important because it provides the lens for how we observe, understand, explain, and respond to behaviors or situations, and can guide the work of programs and agencies. Yosso posits that the experience of being from a “socially marginalized” group in the United States results in the development of particular assets and strengths—referred to as “community cultural wealth”—that often go unrecognized. This capital comes in six forms—aspirational, navigational, social, linguistic, familial, and resistant—and is drawn on by collegiate students of color in ways that enable them to positively navigate educational settings and move toward positive outcomes.

While Yosso’s theoretical model was developed to inform approaches to higher education, its premise—identifying assets to understand how marginalized groups navigate potentially challenging systems—is appropriate for informing the ways in which practitioners assess, engage with, and serve Black families and children in early care and education (and other) settings. However, every culture is unique and there are distinct differences within cultural groups, as well as intersecting issues and experiences that might shape the value placed on different dimensions of capital. For example, the experiences of, resources, and cultural capital available to an American-born Black family with young children living in the rural South are likely to be qualitatively different than those of a recently immigrated Black family with children located in a large city in the Northeast. Understanding context is a critical task for using Yosso’s model. Additionally, while Yosso presents the various forms of social capital individually, they are not mutually exclusive, meaning that categories overlap and build off one another to create a community of cultural wealth.
Figure 1 summarizes the six cultural capital categories articulated in Yosso’s model. We then consider their application to the State of Babies indicators, sharing concrete examples and highlighting considerations for their use in early care and education settings.

**Figure 1. Six cultural capital categories from Yosso (2005)**

**Aspirational capital** refers to one’s ability to maintain hopes and dreams for the future, “even in the face of real and perceived barriers.” Utilization of this form of capital enables people to remain steadfast in working toward better situations, even without the means to attain those goals.

**Navigational capital** refers to skills and abilities that can be used to maneuver through environments that are unsupportive, hostile, or in opposition to people of color.

**Social capital** refers to people and other resources that can be accessed to support educational or professional access, growth, and advancement.

**Linguistic capital** refers to a variety of communication (storytelling, visual art, music, poetry, etc.) and language skills, as well as the intellectual and oral traditions of people of color.

**Familial capital** refers to the personal, family, and communal relationships and resources that can be accessed via broad kinship and community networks.

**Resistant capital** refers to the knowledge and skills used to seek social justice and equal rights and to challenge inequality and oppression.

**Applying a Strengths-Based Model to the State of Babies Yearbook 2021 Domains and Indicators**

Below, we describe the three *State of Babies Yearbook* 2021 domains, highlighting at least one indicator within each domain relevant to early care and education practitioners, and to others who work with families who have infants and toddlers. For each indicator explored, we provide a broad overview of what *State of Babies* data and other research tell us. Notably, the 2021 Yearbook findings are based on pre-pandemic data. For this reason, we also highlight RAPID-EC data, whenever possible, to gain better insight into how Black families, infants, and toddlers are currently faring. Using Yosso’s cultural wealth model, we then propose ways in which practitioners might draw on cultural assets of Black families and communities to understand and/or address the indicator.
Good Health Domain

Description. The State of Babies Good Health domain includes indicators focused on mothers’ and babies’ physical and mental health, which is the foundation for infant and toddlers’ well-being. (We note, however, the absence of research on parents of other genders in the research on infant and toddler development.) Indicators include access to health care, maternal and infant health outcomes, food insecurity and nutrition support, and mental health. Data from this domain indicate that Black families are doing well in some areas—for example, nationally, 96.4 percent of low-income Black children are insured—but are experiencing challenges in other areas. For example, just 64.1 percent of Black mothers and babies have enough food to eat when they are hungry, and approximately half (53.4%) of Black families were able to maintain preventative health care (e.g., a well-child visit for their children) during to the COVID pandemic.

Highlighted indicator. For this domain, we highlight maternal mental health as an indicator for exploration. This indicator in State of Babies shows that almost 20 percent (19.7%) of Black mothers reported less than optimal mental health. Good maternal mental health is important for many reasons, but especially for its links to children’s physical, intellectual, and emotional outcomes. Caregivers’ anxiety, depression, and stress can trickle down to children. Compared to caregivers who have minimal stress, parents with higher levels of stress report having less positive outlooks on parenting, less parental role satisfaction, and less enjoyment of their children. They are also less confident that parenting activities will have a positive influence on their children.

In general, RAPID-EC data show that the initial decrease in maternal mental health at the start of the pandemic is changing for the better as families gain greater stability. Black households, however—along with lower-income and single-parent households, both of which have disproportionately higher numbers of representation among Black people—are not reporting these improvements.

Practitioner approach. When determining how best to support families, practitioners will often conduct assessments to understand a family’s history and prior experiences. For this indicator, utilization of Yosso’s Navigational and Familial Capital categories provides a frame to better understand and support mothers in this area. Understanding the historical context of the health care system in relationship to Black people is a recommended first step, as is understanding the types of social support systems utilized by Black families. Historically, Black people have expressed a healthy level of skepticism of the health care system, which has resulted from racist and discriminatory practices within the medical field. More current research also indicates a reluctance by Black people to acknowledge psychological problems and engage with mental health services.
In addition, Black people have also consistently used extended family networks and relationships among non-familial friends and individuals as sources of social support. An enduring legacy of the African heritage of Black families, these exchanges have been found to contribute to the psychological well-being of Black people and have helped Black families survive hostile environments.

Religious institutions also fulfill social, political, financial, and social service needs for Black people. While younger generations are not as connected to formal religion, research suggests that belief in a higher power, spirituality, and kinship ties are a predominant source of psychological strength among Black people.

Individuals who have greater Familial Capital can draw on extended networks of family and friends to help them care for themselves and their children during these particularly stressful times. Additionally, family and friend networks can advocate for and provide information on accessing resources to support new parents and their child’s growth and development. By examining the Navigational Capital of Black communities and individuals, practitioners can gain insight about the ways that current systems can be hostile toward Black families, and how families have succeeded in getting their needs met despite systemic barriers.
Description. The Strong Families domain acknowledges the importance of family context for infants and toddlers. It includes indicators reflecting well-being, economic resources, physical environment, and the experiences of infants and toddlers in the child welfare system. For example, when considering well-being, 77.7 percent of Black families reported being able to bounce back from adversity, a potential marker of resilience. In terms of physical environment, almost 18 percent of Black families reported living in crowded housing and 97.5 percent reported having stable housing.

Highlighted indicator. For this domain, we highlight the “crowded” indicator, which emphasizes the percentage of infants and toddlers living in situations with two or more people per bedroom—or, in residences with no bedrooms, where more than one person resides per room. Nationally, the State of Babies indicator reveals that 17.8 percent of Black babies live in crowded housing. Living in overcrowded conditions—alongside other experiences such as difficulty paying rent, frequent moves, living with relatives, or spending most of one’s income on housing costs—is indicative of housing instability. For Black families, the lack of stable housing and experiences of homelessness often result from racist and discriminatory housing policies and programs. For example, redlining, or the refusal to provide financing for homes in areas with high concentrations of Black residents, led to the segregation of Black people in distressed areas and created persistent challenges for Black families in obtaining stable housing. These harmful practices still exist today, and include both implicit and explicit discrimination in renting practices and the provision of mortgages to Black families. The end result is a housing system that promotes and supports racial inequities, making acquisition of a stable home difficult to establish and maintain.

Practitioner approach. Yosso’s Familial Capital category is useful for reexamining and challenging the ways in which Black families with infants and toddlers may experience the crowded housing indicator. For instance, as currently written, the crowded housing indicator obscures the cultural history of Black families that prioritize living closely with or near family members and the sharing of space and household tasks in a stable context. Choosing to live with extended family members or others during a child’s early years may be an important strategy that can positively support parents’ and children’s mental health and well-being (Familial Capital). A “crowded” house may, in fact, provide opportunities to combine limited social and economic resources. For instance, having access to multiple adults in a home, shared income, and opportunities to pool resources could support participation in educational or employment opportunities for Black parents (i.e., Social Capital).
To develop a well-rounded picture of a family’s context and living arrangement choices, practitioners should gather and assess information about parents’ choices regarding housing options, the roles of the individuals within the shared spaces, and their contributions to the household. Viewing the “crowded” indicator through Yosso’s cultural capital lens, prevents the assumption of a universal ideal for family structure and living arrangements, and illuminates the way in which cultural assets and choices inform decision making and are central to families’ well-being.

**Positive Early Learning Experiences Domain**

**Domain description.** The *State of Babies* Positive Early Learning Experiences domain highlights the ways in which infants and toddlers learn through interactions with significant adults and via their attachment to enriching environments. Indicators in this domain include parent-child interactions and insights about three formal early childhood systems that support infants and toddlers: child care, Early Head Start, and early intervention. Data from this domain describe time available for high-quality parent-child interactions, assistance for families who cannot afford high-cost child care, availability of Early Head Start programs, and rates of developmental screenings for infants and toddlers.

Highlighted indicator(s). For this domain, we highlight two indicators focused on adult-child interactions—“parent reads to babies every day” and “parent sings or tells stories to babies every day.” Nationally, 24 percent of Black parents read to their babies every day and 45.4 percent sing or tell stories to their baby every day. When considering infant and toddler development, reading, music, and songs have been shown to lay the foundation for early literacy skills in young children by introducing language, patterns, rhymes, stories, and sequences. Additionally, studies have found that parents’ storytelling and use of expressive language are areas of strength for Black children. These indicators are worth further exploration and have particular current relevance, as the COVID-19 pandemic has resulted in closure of child care centers across the country which has forced many parents (most often women) to serve as unplanned child care providers for their children. In some cases, family members or friends have also served in this role. Understanding how Black families view caretaking activities, and in what ways they engage with children, can not only broaden our current understanding of early literacy practices in Black families, but also highlight ways in which these practices may support the cultural identity and development of Black children.
**Practitioner approach.** As the *State of Babies* indicators show, Black families sing or tell stories at higher rates than they read to their children, a finding that is aligned with Yosso’s Linguistic Capital category, which notes that people of color utilize a variety of communication styles and methods to stimulate intellectual growth. For example, storytelling has been cited as a primary mechanism for keeping Black history, genealogy, and tradition alive.\(^{76,77}\) This practice has linkages to slavery, when prohibiting literacy was used as a tool by slaveowners and traders to limit independence, control enslaved Black people, and prevent freedom.\(^ {78,79}\) Other forms of communication, such as music and singing, have been similarly deeply ingrained in Black culture since African people were kidnapped from their native lands. Music and song were used to communicate during the trans-Atlantic passage to the Americans and the Caribbean. Black people have also used music, song, and visual arts to code messages and share information they did not want their enslavers to understand, such as when making plans to escape—an example of both Aspirational and Resistant Capital.\(^ {80}\)

The higher percentage of Black parents who reported singing and storytelling than who reported reading to their babies may reflect this history. Practitioners working with Black families with infants and toddlers should aim to understand the process and content of these types of interactions. While storytelling and singing is sometimes not afforded the same level of importance or value in educational systems as learning to read,\(^ {81}\) Rapid-EC data presented in Report 1\(^ {82}\) suggest that these parent-child exchanges may be examples of Social, Navigational, Aspirational, and Resistant Capital. Parents are not only serving as an educational resource for their children by enhancing literacy and other skills that may be limited in formal early care and education settings (Social Capital); the content of these exchanges includes explicit attention to cultural and racial identities, and an intentional effort to transmit values, beliefs, and ideas around cultural knowledge and the competencies needed to function in a country and within systems (Navigational Capital) that are hostile to Black people (Aspirational Capital).

Practitioners should recognize the potential significance and importance of various types of communication that Black families use and how these communication styles may be accessed to transmit protective cultural awareness, values, and norms.
Conclusion

This brief has used select State of Babies indicators to highlight the strengths and cultural assets of Black people. Our aim has been to inform service provision for Black families with infants and toddlers that draws on cultural assets and uses a strengths-based perspective. In addition to informing service provision, this brief also provides an opportunity to rethink how currently existing indicators might fall short by collecting and highlighting data that does not attend to context, culture, or assets. For example, while the State of Babies indicators are solidly grounded in research about circumstances and activities that are supportive of infant and toddler development, the studies that have historically informed this work generally focus on White, middle-class people, resulting in indicators that may not be reflective of the underlying values and beliefs of Black families. While beyond the scope of this brief, we recommend further consideration for collecting indicator (or other) data in a way that is broad enough to be applicable to different populations, but also equitable and centered on positive Black experiences. Such considerations in data collection may advance the shift away from deficit orientations in service provision and from policies that do not recognize or attend to the strengths and assets of Black families, infants, and toddlers.
About Child Trends
Child Trends is the nation’s leading research organization focused exclusively on improving the lives of children and youth, especially underrepresented and historically disadvantaged populations. Child Trends works to ensure that all young people thrive by conducting independent research and partnering with practitioners, policymakers, and communities to apply that knowledge. Child Trends brings a racial equity perspective to all its work, and believes that programs and policies that serve children are most effective when they are informed by data and evidence and grounded in deep knowledge of child and youth development. Child Trends’ expertise spans early childhood development, child welfare, school climate, reproductive health, family formation, juvenile justice, trauma, and youth development.

About the Equity Research Action Coalition at the UNC Frank Porter Graham Child Development Institute
The Equity Research Action Coalition, a university-based collaborative, focuses on co-constructing actionable research and evaluation with practitioners and policymakers to support the optimal development of Black children prenatally through childhood across the African diaspora. The Coalition works at the intersection of research, program, and practice through anti-racist and cultural wealth frameworks. The Coalition focuses on developing a science-based action framework to eradicate the impact of racism and poverty and all its consequences on the lives of Black children, families, and communities, and to ensure their optimal health and well-being.

Suggested Citation:
Endnotes

8 Ibid.
14 Lloyd et al., 2021a.
15 Ibid.
23 McWayne et al., 2013.
24 Lloyd et al, 2021a.
25 Keating et al., 2021.
26 Ibid.
27 Yosso, 2005.
32 Yosso, 2005.


81 Frank Porter Graham Child Development Institute. (2015, August 5). Storytelling skills support early literacy for African American children: Early narrative skills are tied to kindergarten literacy among young African American children, according to new research. ScienceDaily.